Review Article



Check for updates

Tracing plant–environment interactions from organismal to planetary scales using stable isotopes: a mini review

^(D) Gavin McNicol¹, Zhongjie Yu², Z. Carter Berry³, Nathan Emery⁴, Fiona M. Soper⁵ and Wendy H. Yang⁶

¹Department of Earth and Environmental Science, University of Illinois at Chicago, Chicago, IL, U.S.A.; ²Department of Natural Resources and Environmental Sciences, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, Urbana, IL, U.S.A.; ³Schmid College of Science and Technology, Chapman University, Orange, CA, U.S.A.; ⁴Department of Plant Biology, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, U.S.A.; ⁵Department of Biology and Bieler School of Environment, McGill University, Montreal, QC, Canada; ⁶Departments of Plant Biology and Geology, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, Urbana, IL, U.S.A.

Correspondence: Gavin McNicol (gmcnicol@uic.edu)

Natural isotope variation forms a mosaic of isotopically distinct pools across the biosphere and flows between pools integrate plant ecology with global biogeochemical cycling. Carbon, nitrogen, and water isotopic ratios (among others) can be measured in plant tissues, at root and foliar interfaces, and in adjacent atmospheric, water, and soil environments. Natural abundance isotopes provide ecological insight to complement and enhance biogeochemical research, such as understanding the physiological conditions during photosynthetic assimilation (e.g. water stress) or the contribution of unusual plant water or nutrient sources (e.g. fog, foliar deposition). While foundational concepts and methods have endured through four decades of research, technological improvements that enable measurement at fine spatiotemporal scales, of multiple isotopes, and of isotopomers, are advancing the field of stable isotope ecology. For example, isotope studies now benefit from the maturation of field-portable infrared spectroscopy, which allows the exploration of plant-environment sensitivity at physiological timescales. Isotope ecology is also benefiting from, and contributing to, new understanding of the plant-soil-atmosphere system, such as improving the representation of soil carbon pools and turnover in land surface models. At larger Earth-system scales, a maturing global coverage of isotope data and new data from site networks offer exciting synthesis opportunities to merge the insights of single-or multi-isotope analysis with ecosystem and remote sensing data in a data-driven modeling framework, to create geospatial isotope products essential for studies of global environmental change.

Introduction to stable isotope ecology concepts and methods

Stable isotopes have been used to study plant ecology for more than four decades, with an early focus and organismal physiology and quantifying associated isotope effects, and how they vary along environmental gradients [1,2]. In the last two decades, isotope analysis has expanded to consider the role of plants in biogeochemical cycling and its sensitivity to anthropogenic perturbation, both at fine resolution and at larger spatial scales (Figure 1).

The ratio of heavy-to-light stable isotope abundance of carbon $({}^{13}C/{}^{12}C)$, nitrogen $({}^{15}N/{}^{14}N)$, oxygen $({}^{18}O/{}^{16}O$ and ${}^{17}O/{}^{16}O)$, and hydrogen $({}^{2}H/{}^{1}H)$ varies naturally within different plant tissues, and between plants and the soil, water, and atmospheric pools they interact with [5]. Even very subtle differences in the ratio (at the third or greater decimal place) are detectable with both laboratory-based mass spectrometry and, more recently, field-deployable infrared spectroscopy [6,7]. Measured isotope ratios are reported as apparent positive or negative deviations (e.g. $\delta^{13}C$) in units of per mil (‰) from

Received: 6 December 2020 Revised: 28 January 2021 Accepted: 29 January 2021

Version of Record published: 26 February 2021







Keywords are arranged from the largest increase (top) to smallest increase (bottom) and categorized into disciplines, though several keywords overlap with several disciplines. Connections between plant ecology and biogeochemical cycles of carbon, water, and nitrogen show the largest increases. Soil organisms and processes appear more frequently, including fungi, decomposition, and respiration. Entirely new keywords in the last decade reflect wastewater applications of nitrogen isotopes as well as multi-isotope approaches. The Biblioshiny application [3] in R [4] was first used to search Web of Science for all literature containing the words 'stable isotope'' and 'plant*', and 'carbon' or 'nitrogen' or 'oxygen', including ecology, environmental sciences and water, agronomy and forestry disciplines, and excluding zoology, paleontology, and the geosciences. A total of 3783 articles were retrieved and dated back to 1977, with 1247 (roughly one-third) published since 2016. A full set of 8500 keywords was then retrieved from this bibliography using the Web of Science *KeyWords Plus*® algorithm, an augmented method that is preferred over standard keyword or title retrieval. Finally, of the 1374 unique keywords, 20 of interest were identified and their occurrence for the decades of 1991–2000 and 2011–2020 was summed.

known international standards [8]. Environmental patterns in measured stable isotope ratios (isotope values, hereafter) are constrained by kinetic and equilibrium processes that alter the isotopic composition as isotopes move between pools (i.e. have isotope effects; Box 1) [9]. Kinetic isotope effects occur due to differences in unidirectional process rates between the heavy and light isotopes and are often associated with enzymatic reactions



Term	Definition	
lsotope (stable)	Two or more forms of the same element that contain equal numbers of protons but different numbers of neutrons in their nuclei, and do not undergo radioactive decay. Isotopes therefore differ in relative atomic mass but not in chemical properties.	
Isotopologue*	Molecular species that differ only in isotopic composition (number of isotopic substitutions) and relative molecular mass, e.g. ¹² C ¹⁶ O ₂ , ¹³ C ¹⁶ O ₂ , ¹² C ¹⁸ O ¹⁶ O. The term isotopologue is a contraction of 'isotope analogue'.	
Isotopomer*	Molecular species having the same number of each isotopic atom (thus, the same relative molecular mass) but differing in their positions, e.g. ¹² C ¹⁸ O ¹⁶ O, ¹² C ¹⁶ O ¹⁸ O. The term is a contraction of 'isotopic isomer'.	
Isotope effect* (or isotopic fractionation)	Alteration of either the equilibrium constant or the rate constant of a reaction (kinetic) if an atom in a reactant molecule is replaced by one of its isotopes.	
Isotope balance*	Determination of the amount or isotope-amount ratio of a substance in a mixture by making use of the fact that the sum of the amounts of the isotopes of each constituent of the mixture must equal the total in the system.	
Isoflux	Isotopically weighted gas fluxes derived from isotopic balance. Typically measured using micrometeorological techniques (i.e. eddy covariance).	
Isoscape	Spatial (geographic) patterns in natural isotope abundances.	
Isotope mixing model	An essential mathematical tool for both natural abundance and labeled isotope studies which exploits differences in isotope values and quantities (for <i>n</i> isotopes) to identify and quality relative contributions of two or more (up to $n + 1$) distinct elemental sources [13].	

Box 1. Stable isotope terminology used in this paper. Terms denoted by an asterisk were defined by the Commission on Isotopic Abundances and Atomic Weights of the IUPAC [12].

such as photosynthetic assimilation or cellular respiration but also with abiotic processes such as the evaporation of water. In almost all cases, the flux of the lighter isotope is faster (or lighter isotope is favored in reactions) and the flux of the heavier isotope is slower (or heavier isotope is discriminated against) [10]. In contrast, equilibrium isotope effects occur via the passive partitioning of molecules between adjacent pools based on differences in molecular bond strength due, for example, to differences in phases, such as when carbon dioxide (CO_2) dissolves in water [10]. Equilibrium fractionation can also be affected by environmental conditions, particularly temperature. Both kinetic and equilibrium isotope effects are reported in units of ‰ and, in combination, create a complex and dynamic mosaic of isotope values within plants and across the environment. In addition to natural variation arising from kinetic and equilibrium isotope, typically to the percent level. Although labels overwhelm signals from kinetic and equilibrium isotope effects, labeled substrate pools can be traced through plants and into the local environment (pulse-chase experiments), or alternatively, a labeled product pool can be diluted by ongoing reactions at natural isotopic abundances (pool dilution experiments) [11].

Several detailed reviews document how stable isotopes are useful integrators and tracers in plant ecology [9,14-16]. In this mini review, we highlight a select few well-established and emerging isotope applications, with a focus on connecting plants to the planetary, and increasingly human-altered, biogeochemical cycles of C, N, and water (Figure 2).

Carbon

Plant photosynthesis is the largest flux in the global C cycle (~120 Pg C y⁻¹) and constrains human food, fiber, and fuel production via the productivity of the terrestrial biosphere [17]. Plant biomass δ^{13} C reflects the biological regulation of, and environmental conditions for, photosynthesis, providing records of environmental change in the distant and recent past, which may also serve as useful analogues for current global change [9,15]. Plant photosynthetic pathway (C3 vs. C4 vs. CAM) (Box 2), genetics, lifecycle, and morphology, as well as meteorology, soil conditions, and ecological interactions can all alter plant δ^{13} C, with these environmental and physiological signals being gradually integrated into plant biomass over time [9,18]. As in the study of leaf-level photosynthesis, studies of δ^{13} C at larger scales can help inform a more detailed understanding of the constraints on photosynthesis and C cycle responses to future global change.







The most commonly measured (top, large circles) and less frequently measured (top, small circles) heavy isotopes, and the molecular forms dominant in the atmosphere (top, text), are cycled through terrestrial ecosystems; entering via active assimilation, including via foliar uptake or fixation in root nodules, as well as passive deposition processes, passing through surface and belowground transport pathways, and microbial transformations, and are re-emitted as gases from direct or plant-mediated surface exchanges. Note that, although we only show the heavy isotopes, isotope values are always reported relative to the abundance of more common, lighter isotope (e.g. carbon-12) which is measured simultaneously. Several processes cause isotope effects due to isotopic fractionation (orange) (e.g. from atmospheric CO₂ to plant biomass, and from soil nitrate to nitrous oxide emissions). Other processes (black), often passive, are associated with smaller, negligible, or poorly defined intrinsic isotope effects.

In C3 plants, which account for ~75% of global photosynthesis [19], variation in the isotopic fractionation between atmospheric $\delta^{13}CO_2$ (~-8‰) and plant biomass $\delta^{13}C$ (-28‰ to -33‰) is regulated by the balance of diffusive CO₂ supply from the atmosphere to intracellular spaces, and photosynthetic CO₂ demand [20]. This co-limitation model for C3 photosynthesis, combined with plants' ability to conserve a stable metabolic setpoint, creates a complex sensitivity of plant $\delta^{13}C$ to environmental conditions, which is most readily interpretable at the extremes [14]. For example, diffusion limits CO₂ supply when plants are water-stressed due to stomatal closure, however, stomata also limit diffusion during high irradiance (such as under strong, direct sunlight). In both these cases of stomatal CO₂ supply limitation, C3 photosynthesis isotope effects are smaller and plant biomass becomes more enriched in ¹³C. In agreement with this leaf-level understanding, the first global data-driven model of C3 isotope effects predicted larger isotope effects in the humid tropics and smaller isotope effects in arid and mountainous regions [18]. However, the model also highlighted the complexity of environmental regulation of C3 isotope effects at global scales, with precipitation, atmospheric pressure, potential evapotranspiration, soil pH, and leaf N all identified as key model covariates (Figure 3).

C3 plant isotopes continue to be utilized for the reconstruction of plant function and environmental conditions over time, with tree rings providing a seasonal to annual chronology. Tree ring δ^{13} C analysis has been used to interpret interannual changes in forest productivity during periodic drought [21,22] and to understand how other environmental gradients, such as soil texture, can modulate or mitigate drought-related water stress [21,22]. In free air carbon dioxide enrichment (FACE) experiments, tree ring δ^{13} C analysis has been used to demonstrate increases in ecosystem-scale water use efficiency under elevated CO₂ [23]. More recently, regional scale tree ring δ^{13} C (and δ^{18} O) has been shown to correlate with forest productivity, estimated by satellite



Box 2. Metabolic, environmental, and isotopic characteristics of the three dominant pathways of plant	
photosynthesis [15].	

Pathway	C3	C4	САМ
Metabolism	Calvin cycle: Production of carbohydrates via 3-carbon intermediates from CO ₂ reduction by the enzyme ribulose biphosphate carboxylase/ oxygenase (Rubisco)	4-carbon-dicarboxylic acid pathway: 'Pumping' of CO ₂ to maintain high pressures in vascular bundle sheath cells where fixation occurs, reducing photorespiration	Crassulacean acid metabolism: Nighttime organic acid formation followed by daylight deacidification and refixation of CO ₂ by Rubisco
Ecology and environment	Globally dominant photosynthetic pathway, especially for trees and shrubs.	Advantage over C3 with low CO ₂ or high irradiance, and higher water-and nitrogen-use efficiency than C3. Tropical and salt grasses; food and biofuel crops.	Succulents under high water stress. ~6% of plants globally, which are typically also capable of C3.
Isotope effects	Fixation by Rubisco: -29‰ Stomatal diffusion (in and out): -4.4‰ Net effect: -20‰ Environmental controls (e.g. temperature, moisture, and irradiance) modify effects but are constrained by plant physiology	Bicarbonate fixation: -5.7‰ Bundle-sheath diffusion: 1.8‰ Net effect: -5‰ Varies with cell leakiness and across a much smaller range than C3 or CAM (-11 to -14‰)	Approx. 1.8‰ per 10% contribution of nighttime uptake (-0.7‰ to -20‰) CAM plant biomass can vary by >20‰ depending on the proportion of day (C3) vs. night-time CO ₂ fixation

remote sensing, which can enable tree ring-based reconstructions of biome productivity over centuries to millennia [24]. Important adjustments have been made to the co-limitation model of C3 photosynthesis and its isotope effects [25,26] to account for metabolic processes such as mesophyll conductance, intracellular respiration, and translocation of compounds into different plant tissues [27]. Although seemingly small, changes in mesophyll conductance and photorespiration isotope effects since the 1970s, caused by rising atmospheric CO_2 and plant water use efficiency (~0.014‰ ppm⁻¹), have been enough to alter global atmospheric $\delta^{13}CO_2$ [28].



Figure 3. Global patterns in the absolute magnitude of C3 plant photosynthetic carbon isotope effects (δ) in units of per mil (‰), modeled from 3645 C3 leaf observations of δ^{13} C. (Reproduced from Cornwell et al. [18] with permission from John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.).





Tracing ¹³C in the Plant-Soil-Atmosphere System

Figure 4. Natural and experimental ¹³C labeling of plant biomass enables the tracing of C through the plant-soil-atmosphere system. Isotopic tracing requires a perturbation in the photosynthetically fixed isotope signal with either a synthetic (experimental) label or a major natural shift in photosynthesis, such as a C3–C4 transition (red environmental interactions). Plants can rapidly assimilate and re-respire a portion of this C on timescales of less than a day, while another portion is translocated and exuded into the rhizosphere over the course of several hours to several days. Microbial biomass turnover and active transport by mycorrhizal fungal move C belowground on monthly timescales, while microbial necromass accumulation and decomposition processes over seasons or multiple years lead to the incorporation of C into soil organic matter pools associated with different stabilization mechanisms, and thus of different age and persistence. Finally, over decades or more, the accumulation of belowground C and large-scale shifts in the isotope effects of photosynthesis (e.g. decadal and regional scale shifts from C3 to C4) can lead to changes in the $\delta^{13}CO_2$ value of even the well-mixed global atmosphere.

Stable C isotopes can also be used to trace plant-soil-atmosphere C cycling (Figure 4). Natural ¹³C tracer experiments arise from C3 (biomass δ^{13} C ca. -28%) to C4 (biomass δ^{13} C ca. -13%) shifts in the photosynthetic pathway of vegetation [29] which can be associated with succession, invasion, climate change, or land use change [9]. Isotope mass balance is then used to estimate subsequent effects on soil C content, such as C sequestration or loss, which are otherwise difficult to measure directly [27,30]. C3-C4 transitions and their soil C effects have been studied extensively, with recent applications in bioenergy crops to study lifecycle C budgets (e.g. *Panicum virgatum*; [31,32]). New opportunities also exist in data synthesis, demonstrated by a recent global metanalysis of 47 C3-C4 field studies [33] which used isotope data to model global soil C age-depth distributions and found that recent C inputs account for a small fraction of total soil C globally, raising important questions about soil C residence times. At finer scales, ¹³C pulse-chase labeling experiments are being used in combination with increasingly sophisticated compound-specific analyses and metabolomics to quantify plant C allocation [34], to trace plant-derived C into actively metabolizing microbial communities (such as mycorrhizal fungi 'highways' that share C among trees even of different species [35–37]), and to distinguish different pathways of soil organic matter formation and persistence [38]. Many of these new plant-soil system applications are still rapidly evolving and their target questions remain largely unresolved.

Elevated CO_2 concentrations and increasing temperatures are changing terrestrial ecosystem photosynthesis and respiration, with potential for both positive and negative C cycle and climate feedbacks [39,40]. Isotope analysis can be applied to the study of net ecosystem CO_2 exchanges by pairing high-frequency measurements of canopy ¹³CO₂ and ¹²CO₂ mixing ratios with micrometeorological methods used to estimate fluxes of both CO_2 isotopologues (isofluxes; [41]). Isofluxes of CO_2 can also be used to partition net ecosystem exchange measurements into their component photosynthesis and respiration fluxes, providing independent estimates and new insights into cryptic processes such as light-inhibition of respiration [42–44]. Although isoflux-based



partitioning causes little or no ecosystem disturbance, the δ^{13} C of net ecosystem exchange still requires careful interpretation due to its mix of different plant and soil microbial signals [45]. Exciting opportunities are also being created by the growth of networked observations of isofluxes. Profiles of atmospheric δ^{13} C and δ^{18} O and δ^{2} H measurements, and soil, root, foliar, and litter δ^{13} C, are now being collected at 47 sites representative of continental United States ecoregions as part of a National Ecological Observatory Network (NEON), with many records already extending >3 years [46].

Water

Vegetation not only moves up to 95% of surface water to the atmosphere but also stores and regulates large pools of water that influence energy, C, and nutrient fluxes [47,48]. Tracing the movement and storage of water in plants and into the environment is made possible with the heavy stable isotopes of oxygen (δ^{18} O, δ^{17} O) and hydrogen (δ^{2} H) [49]. Water isotopes are useful because their prevalence varies greatly across environmental pools (e.g. bodies of water, streams, woody tissue, leaves, atmosphere, and clouds), allowing us to trace water from one pool to another [50]. In particular, water isotopes allow for better understanding of water movement at the leaf-atmosphere boundary, within plant tissues, and through soil.

Plants exchange water with the atmosphere primarily through leaves and photosynthetic tissues. Water isotopes provide insights into plant function during drought, complementary to those discussed for ¹³C. Studies combining ¹⁸O and ¹³C measurements reinforce the idea that stomatal closure leads to increased water use efficiency (enriched δ^{18} O) while also limiting C assimilation (enriched δ^{13} C) [51,52], with important implications for predicting drought-related plant mortality and parameterizing climate models. Water isotopes also continue to provide new insights about the complex dynamics of water exchange at the leaf-atmosphere interface, which is multidirectional (e.g. foliar water uptake; [53-55]) and varies along spatial and temporal scales [53-55]. For example, a long-held assumption is that leaf water flows exclusively from saturated (within-leaf) to unsaturated (atmospheric) conditions. However, water isotopes have been used to show that the vapor pressure inside leaves is not always saturated [56], complicating models of leaf-atmosphere dynamics. Another avenue of inquiry finds that the flow of hydrogen to cellulose, non-structural carbohydrates, and sugars can produce consistent differences in isotope values, providing new opportunities to study leaf biochemical processes [57,58]. Overall, a finer resolution understanding of leaf water dynamics is valuable for modeling and predicting plant water use, atmospheric exchange, and responses to climate change. Future studies of fine-scale spatial variation in leaf water isotopes must consider the Péclet effect, whereby the inward flow of unenriched water from xylem is counteracted by backward diffusion of enriched water from evaporation [59]. Barbour et al. [60] suggest the use of a spatially explicit model that accommodates water in the liquid and gas phase as well as internal temperature gradients.

As water moves through plants, the possibility of mixing and exchange among plant tissues cannot be overlooked (Figure 5). Use of stable isotopic labeling of water has shown that water flow throughout the plant is not homogenous [61]. Differences across species and environmental contexts have been observed in lateral mixing and the connectivity of xylem in certain locations with different root sections [62,63]. What is becoming clear is that xylem, phloem, cambium, bark, and other supporting cells are likely to have distinct isotope values suggesting significant mixing of water sources across space and time [64–66]. These flows are multidirectional [67] and occur daily [68]. Increasing the spatial and temporal resolution of stable isotope measurements will allow us to resolve these dynamic multidirectional flows within plants.

Perhaps the most common application of stable isotopes of water is sourcing where plants are obtaining their water. Plant strategies of water use, identified with water isotopes, range from almost exclusive reliance on upper soil layer sources [69] to more than half deriving from deeper groundwater sources [70]. Water sources also appear to vary with environmental conditions [71], raising new questions about the plasticity of this response to climate change. For example, as drought threatens ecosystem resilience via reduced or altered water flows, plants can seek out deeper water sources, and this plasticity mitigates plant water impacts over multiple drought years [72]. In plant ecology studies, water samples are obtained from precipitation, multiple soil depths, groundwater, and potentially even fog or dew [9,73]. Using δ^{18} O and δ^{2} H to determine the origins of water within a plant relies on the assumption that the isotope value is conserved across pools (i.e. does not fractionate). While some studies have found this to be true [74], an increase in spatial sampling precision has revealed multiple examples of isotopic fractionation (Figure 5), complicating conclusions. Studies have found isotopic fractionation within soil [75], at the soil–root interface [76,77], in the presence of arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi [78], during foliar water uptake [79], and when xylem and bulk tissue water interact [65,66]. Soil



Figure 5. Water movement across substrates, tissues, and the atmosphere can cause isotopic fractionation resulting in isotopic enrichment (plus symbol) or depletion (minus symbol) in the heavy isotopes of H and O. Fractionation occurs belowground within the soil [75], from soil to the atmosphere [9], and between soil and roots [77]. Internally, isotopic fractionation occurs across bulk tissues [65] and within leaves [59]. Between the leaf surface and the atmosphere, transpiration can cause enrichment [9] and foliar water uptake can lead to depletion [79] in leaf water. Mycorrhizal

fungi can also lead to isotopic depletion in roots [78]. These dynamic interactions provide new avenues for research and challenges for studying the movement of water isotopes in plants.

water fractionation tends to be of more concern in shallow, dry soils and can alter water pool isotope values and plant water stable isotope mixtures [80]. Isotopic fractionation, while generally not thought to occur at the soil-root boundary [9], may yet have an influence on plant water isotopic values.

Water isotopes have become a powerful tool for understanding the movement of water through the plantsoil-atmosphere system and how this ecosystem will respond to climate change. New frontiers include increased spatiotemporal sample resolution, allowing investigators to map water movement through soils, plants, and the atmosphere in three dimensions and capturing instantaneous dynamics. New methods that allow for *in situ* quantification of water isotopes using gas-permeable membranes with laser spectroscopes [81,82] could lead to constant monitoring of plant water uptake from understudied sources, such as leaf and



bark absorption, without destructive sampling. Spatially, we are starting to isolate water pools of specific cell types in plants [65], particular molecules (e.g. cellulose vs. carbohydrates), and even from water vapor on leaf surfaces [83] and in the soil [84]. Matching these plant-related advances with increased spatial fidelity in adjacent soil environments is a promising research direction, particularly in zones surrounding fine roots, mycorrhizal associations, and in partitioning bound and unbound water [78,85,86].

Nitrogen

Nitrogen (N) is a critical limiting element for plant growth and production. Humans have roughly doubled annual fixation of reactive N since the 19th century [87] and the resulting enrichment of reactive N can cause N fertilization effects, stoichiometric imbalances, decreases in biodiversity and facilitation of invasive plant species, soil acidification, and production of climatically important N trace gases (e.g. nitrous oxide (N_2O)) [88]. Ecosystem responses to increased N availability therefore strongly depend on how N is transported, transformed, and recycled in the plant-soil system.

Nitrogen stable isotopes can be used to trace the N cycle, from uptake in individual roots over the course of days to integrating decadal trends towards increased N availability at continental scales (Figure 6a). For example, ¹⁵N enrichment of arbuscular mycorrhizal fungal (AMF) hyphae and associated roots following decomposition of ¹⁵N-enriched root litter demonstrated the role of AMF in supplying litter-derived N to plants, with nanometer-scale secondary ion mass spectrometry (NanoSIMS) providing detailed



Figure 6. Simplified schematic representation of the soil–plant N cycle and associated N isotope effects. (a) Major N pools are shown in circles and major fluxes by arrows: (1) aboveground litter and residue input; (2) root litter and exudate input; (3) dissolution and depolymerization of high molecular mass soil organic N (SON); (4) adsorption of dissolved organic N (DON) to mineral soil matrix; (5) microbial death and subsequent stabilization of microbial biomass nitrogen (MBN) into SON; (6) DON uptake; (7) extracellular ammonification; (8) intracellular deamination; (9) NH₄⁺ uptake; (10) nitrification; (11) dissimilatory NO₃⁻ reduction to NH₄⁺; (12) NO₃⁻ uptake; (13) denitrification; (14) biological N₂ fixation. Addition of ¹⁵N-labeled compounds to a plant or soil N pool and tracing through other reservoirs allows for a quantitative inquiry into the sources and fates of N in the soil–plant system. (b) To understand the distribution of natural abundance N isotopes among different plant and soil pools, several important soil N transformation processes have been studied for their N isotope effects (adapted from [16,98,99]). The distinct fractionating patterns revealed for these processes underpin the integrated nature of natural abundance N isotopes in tracing N dynamics in the plant–soil system.



spatial maps of ¹⁵N enrichment within fungal and plant tissues [89]. In addition to SIMS, other mass spectrometry imaging techniques are now enabling spatially resolved interrogation of how plants interact with the biotic and abiotic environment, such as matrix-assisted laser desorption ionization mass spectrometry (MALDI-MS) used to trace plant uptake of ¹⁵N-labeled nitrate into identifiable metabolites within plant tissues [90]. In agricultural systems, many studies have utilized ¹⁵N-labeling to determine the proportion of fertilizer recovered in crops (i.e. fertilizer-use efficiency). A synthetic analysis of these studies unveiled a surprisingly low efficiency (e.g. <50%) in intensively managed cereal crop systems [91,92], highlighting a strong modulation of N transformations and retention by soil microbial communities. To avoid possible stimulation of process rates by the addition of ¹⁵N label to the substrate pool, the isotope pool dilution approach utilizes ¹⁵N label addition to the product pool to estimate gross production rates of the product [11]. ¹⁵N labeling of various soil N pools has been used to measure gross rates of N depolymerization, ammonification, and nitrification [93,94] (Figure 6a). More recently, this approach has been applied to trace gases, notably allowing for field-based measurements of gross N₂O production and consumption rates, which are otherwise difficult to quantify [95–97].

Instead of adding ¹⁵N labels to the plant-soil system, natural abundance δ^{15} N in various plant and soil reservoirs can be used as a non-invasive and integrated measure of N cycling intensity and 'openness' (the ratio of loss to internal recycling). The unique power of natural abundance N isotope measurements stems from the distinct isotopic fractionation during individual N transformation processes mediating the N cycle [100] (Figure 6b). For example, due to a small N isotope effect for the biological fixation of atmospheric N_2 (BNF), N generated through BNF tends to be less enriched than soil-sourced N, allowing for use as a qualitative [101] and under certain specific conditions, a quantitative tracer of BNF (predominantly in agricultural systems) [102]. In contrast, nitrification and denitrification, which often prevail in N-saturated systems, are associated with large kinetic N isotope effects (e.g. >20%; Figure 6b). As such, elevated δ^{15} N values of terrestrial soil and water can be used as an emergent constraint to infer intensity of external N loss (e.g. NO_3^- leaching and N₂O emissions) as well as overall N availability at the ecosystem scale [103]. At the global scale, large datasets of leaf and soil δ^{15} N are increasingly available and have been used to make inferences about broader patterns of plant N availability. Using a database of >40 000 samples over four decades, Craine et al. [104] showed that average foliar percent N and δ^{15} N have simultaneously decreased; evidence of an overall increase in plant C fixation (due to, for example, increased atmospheric CO_2 and longer growing seasons) that has shifted the balance between plant N demand and supply.

While labeled ¹⁵N tracers and natural abundance N isotopes have been extensively used to study the N cycle, they individually suffer from conceptual and technical shortcomings that limit their utility to fully elucidate N cycling complexity (Figure 7). We suggest that combined use of these two isotope techniques (i.e. hybrid isotope tracing) can provide a bridge between mechanistic details and spatiotemporal variability of N cycle dynamics, thereby leading to a more robust understanding of N-plant-environment interactions. Furthermore, recent methodological advances have brought new isotope tracers for probing the plant-soil N cycle that share promising features with both approaches. For example, with two isotopes of N and three of O (i.e. ¹⁶O, ¹⁷O, and ¹⁸O) in a NO₃ molecule, coupled N and O isotope analysis of NO₃ is a powerful tool to unveil NO₃ sources and biogeochemical transformations in the plant-soil system [105]. Historically, δ^{17} O of NO₃⁻ was of minor interest, primarily because the two minor O isotopes in NO₃⁻ (e.g. ¹⁷O and ¹⁸O) are altered by O isotopic fractionation processes in a predictable manner. However, in the late 1990s, studies of atmospheric photochemical reactions revealed an anomalously high abundance of ¹⁷O in atmospheric NO₃⁻ (expressed as Δ^{17} O), as large as 35% [106]. Because the production of nonzero Δ^{17} O values is strictly a photochemical effect, plantand microbially processed NO₃ has Δ^{17} O of 0 [107]. Therefore, Δ^{17} O is a conservative tracer of atmospheric NO_3^- deposition [108] and can be applied to unambiguously identify the uptake of deposited N into soils and plant tissues (via both root and direct foliar uptake) [109] and to quantify gross nitrification [110,111] and denitrification rates [112] at the watershed scale. Limitations of these applications, however, include the fact that rapid assimilation of atmospheric NO₃⁻ by microbes and plants can erase the Δ^{17} O signal, complicating the tracing of Δ^{17} O in the soil-plant system, and that Δ^{17} O analysis is limited to O-containing compounds and excludes ammonium (NH_4^+) , for example [113].

Isotopomers of N₂O, which vary in the intramolecular position of ¹⁵N, are also a potential tool to partition the sources of N₂O among soil nitrifiers and denitrifiers [114,115]. This approach is based on observations from pure culture studies that denitrifiers [116] produce N₂O with lower ¹⁵N site preference (S_p, $\delta^{15}N^{\alpha} - \delta^{15}N^{\beta}$) compared with nitrifiers [117] and fungal denitrifiers [118]. Isotope mapping of S_p against bulk $\delta^{15}N$ [119],





Figure 7. Application of isotope techniques to illuminate the soil-plant N cycle.

Tracing of the plant–soil N cycle is extremely complex due to microsite N variations, the multistep nature of N transformation processes, presence of diverse plant and microbial communities, as well as constant exchange and competition of N between plants and soil microbes. ¹⁵N tracer-based methods are powerful tools for tracing short-term sources and fates of N (blue colors) and can help quantify absolute rates of N transformations (black arrows). However, they are often process-centric and may not provide insights into soil-microbe-plant interactions of reactive N over large temporal and spatial scales. In contrast, although natural abundance δ^{15} N analyses of soil N pools (green colors) are inherently sensitive to uncertainties in and expression levels of relevant N isotope effects [16,101], including those that are poorly-quantified (e.g. dissimilatory nitrate reduction to ammonia), they can provide an integrated assessment on system N dynamics, including the relative importance of different N cycling pathways in the soil–plant system (gray arrows). Together, these two isotope techniques (i.e. hybrid isotope tracing) as well as novel isotope tracers (e.g. Δ^{17} O) have the potential to integrate process-level details of N cycling within the broader context of N-plant–environment interactions across spatial and temporal scales.

bulk δ^{18} O [120], or most recently, both [121] have been used to partition N₂O sources and estimate N₂O reduction rates. However, uncertainty in the N and O isotopic signatures of the substrates for the source processes [122], variation in isotope effects associated with those processes [123], and variation in the S_p of the atmospheric N₂O endmember [124] render isotope mapping estimates more qualitative than quantitative [125]. Laser spectrometers, if used properly, provide promise for broader use of this approach to improve our understanding of controls on S_p variation across spatiotemporal scales, thereby allowing us to better constrain these estimates [122,126,127,122].

Conclusions and outlook

Plant stable isotopes have been used extensively in reconstructions of past ecological changes, such as C3–C4 vegetation transitions, and provide unique information to infer biophysical environmental causes, such as changes in water availability. Isotopes also record plants' metabolic and physiological plasticity in response to changing conditions, such as maintenance of a metabolic set-point or changes in water or nutrients sources. This makes isotopes additionally useful in understanding mechanisms of contemporary global change, as well as potentially helping to constrain plant functional responses in simulations of future conditions. Innovation in stable isotope ecology is likely to continue via merging multi-isotope analysis or isotopomer analysis with increasingly highly resolved measurements of plant tissue and cellular components, the gas, liquid and solid phases of the soil matrix, and high-frequency micrometeorological data. Merging these parallel data streams will allow investigators to study plant ecology across organismal to planetary scales and will provide a more detailed understanding of plants' role in global biogeochemical cycles.



Summary

- Stable isotope measurements provide unique insights into plant ecology and the role of plants in the global biogeochemical cycles of carbon, nitrogen, and water.
- Natural abundance isotope data and mixing models can record environmental conditions experienced during photosynthesis and can reveal novel plant sources of water and nutrients.
- Isotopic labeling enables the tracing of elemental fluxes in the plant-soil-atmosphere system and quantification of gross process rates.
- Increasing the spatiotemporal resolution of isotope measurements will help future investigators study plant–environment exchanges at physiological timescales.
- Evaluation of regional-to-global isotope patterns using data-driven models and global meta-analyses is supporting new isotope ecology research at Earth-system scales.

Competing Interests

The authors declare that there are no competing interests associated with the manuscript.

Funding

W.H.Y. was supported by the U.S. National Science Foundation Dimensions of Biodiversity (Grant Reference No. 1831582) and Z.Y. was supported by Illinois Nutrient Research and Education Council (Grant Reference No. 2021-4-360649-46).

Author Contributions

G.M. wrote the introduction and carbon isotope section, Z.C.B. and N.E. co-wrote the water isotope section, and Z.Y., F.M.S., and W.H.Y. co-wrote the nitrogen isotope section. All authors contributed to final edits.

Acknowledgements

We thank John Wiley and Sons Ltd. for permissions to reproduce a figure from Cornwell et al. [18] under license number 4955131136670.

Abbreviations

AMF, arbuscular mycorrhizal fungal; BNF, biological fixation of atmospheric N₂; CO₂, carbon dioxide.

References

- 1 Reibach, P.H. and Benedict, C.R. (1977) Fractionation of stable carbon isotopes by phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase from C4 plants. *Plant Physiol.* **59**, 564–568 https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.59.4.564
- 2 Farquhar, G.D., von Caemmerer, S. and Berry, J.A. (1980) A biochemical model of photosynthetic CO2 assimilation in leaves of C3 species. *Planta* 149, 78–90 https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00386231
- 3 Aria, M. and Cuccurullo, C. (2017) Bibliometrix: an R-tool for comprehensive science mapping analysis. J. Informetr. **11**, 959–975 https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.joi.2017.08.007
- 4 R Core Team. (2020) R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing, R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria
- 5 Fry, B. (2006) Chapter 1. Introduction. In Stable Isotope Ecology, pp. 1–16, Springer Science+Business Media, New York, NY
- 6 Berman, E.S.F., Gupta, M., Gabrielli, C., Garland, T. and McDonnell, J.J. (2009) High-frequency field-deployable isotope analyzer for hydrological applications. *Water Resour. Res.* 45, W10201 https://doi.org/10.1029/2009WR008265
- 7 West, A.G., Goldsmith, G.R., Brooks, P.D. and Dawson, T.E. (2010) Discrepancies between isotope ratio infrared spectroscopy and isotope ratio mass spectrometry for the stable isotope analysis of plant and soil waters. *Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom.* 24, 1948–1954 https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm. 4597
- 8 Fry, B. (2006) Chapter 2. Isotope Notation and Measurement. In *Stable Isotope Ecology*, pp. 21–37, Springer Science+Business Media, New York, NY



- 9 Dawson, T.E., Mambelli, S., Plamboeck, A.H., Templer, P.H. and Tu, K.P. (2002) Stable isotopes in plant ecology. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst. 33, 507–559 https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.33.020602.095451
- 10 Fry, B. (2006) Chapter 7. Fractionation. In Stable Isotope Ecology, pp. 194–270, Springer Science+Business Media, New York, NY
- 11 Kirkham, D. and Bartholomew, W.V. (1954) Equations for following nutrient transformations in soil, utilizing tracer data. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.* **18**, 33 https://doi.org/10.2136/sssaj1954.03615995001800010009x
- 12 Coplen, T.B. (2011) Guidelines and recommended terms for expression of stable-isotope-ratio and gas-ratio measurement results. *Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom.* **25**, 2538–2560 https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.5129
- 13 Fry, B. (2006) Chapter 7. Mixing. In Stable Isotope Ecology, pp. 119–176, Springer Science+Business Media, New York, NY
- McCarroll, D. and Loader, N.J. (2004) Stable isotopes in tree rings. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 23, 771–801 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2003.06.017
 Cernusak, L.A., Ubierna, N., Winter, K., Holtum, J.A.M., Marshall, J.D. and Farquhar, G.D. (2013) Environmental and physiological determinants of carbon isotope discrimination in terrestrial plants. *New Phytol.* 200, 950–965 https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.12423
- Denk, T.R.A., Mohn, J., Decock, C., Lewicka-Szczebak, D., Harris, E., Butterbach-Bahl, K. et al. (2017) The nitrogen cycle: a review of isotope effects and isotope modeling approaches. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **105**, 121–137 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2016.11.015
- 17 Ryu, Y., Berry, J.A. and Baldocchi, D.D. (2019) What is global photosynthesis? history, uncertainties and opportunities. *Remote Sens. Environ.* **223**, 95–114 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2019.01.016
- 18 Cornwell, W.K., Wright, I.J., Turner, J., Maire, V., Barbour, M.M., Cernusak, L.A. et al. (2018) Climate and soils together regulate photosynthetic carbon isotope discrimination within C-3 plants worldwide. *Glob Ecol. Biogeogr.* **27**, 1056–1067 https://doi.org/10.1111/geb.12764
- 19 Still, C.J., Berry, J.A., Collatz, G.J. and DeFries, R.S. (2003) Global distribution of C3 and C4 vegetation: carbon cycle implications. *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* **17**, 1006 https://doi.org/10.1029/2001GB001807
- 20 Farquhar, G.D., O'Leary, M.H. and Berry, J.A. (1982) On the relationship between carbon isotope discrimination and the intercellular carbon dioxide concentration in leaves. *Funct. Plant Biol.* 9, 121–137 https://doi.org/10.1071/PP9820121
- 21 Timofeeva, G., Treydte, K., Bugmann, H., Rigling, A., Schaub, M., Siegwolf, R. et al. (2017) Long-term effects of drought on tree-ring growth and carbon isotope variability in Scots pine in a dry environment. *Tree Physiol.* **37**, 1028–1041 https://doi.org/10.1093/treephys/tpx041
- 22 Osborn, B.J. and Williams, D.G. (2019) Lodgepole pine tree-ring growth, delta C-13 and the inverse texture effect across a soil chronosequence in glacial till. *Plant Soil* 443, 387–399 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11104-019-04243-2
- 23 Battipaglia, G., Saurer, M., Cherubini, P., Calfapietra, C., McCarthy, H.R., Norby, R.J. et al. (2013) Elevated CO2 increases tree-level intrinsic water use efficiency: insights from carbon and oxygen isotope analyses in tree rings across three forest FACE sites. *New Phytol.* **197**, 544–554 https://doi.org/10. 1111/nph.12044
- 24 Levesque, M., Andreu-Hayles, L., Smith, W.K., Williams, A.P., Hobi, M.L., Allred, B.W. et al. (2019) Tree-ring isotopes capture interannual vegetation productivity dynamics at the biome scale. *Nat. Commun.* 10, 742 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-019-08634-y
- 25 Ubierna, N., Cernusak, L.A., Holloway-Phillips, M., Busch, F.A., Cousins, A.B. and Farquhar, G.D. (2019) Critical review: incorporating the arrangement of mitochondria and chloroplasts into models of photosynthesis and carbon isotope discrimination. *Photosynth. Res.* 141, 5–31 https://doi.org/10.1007/ s11120-019-00635-8
- 26 Busch, F.A., Holloway-Phillips, M., Stuart-Williams, H. and Farquhar, G.D. (2020) Revisiting carbon isotope discrimination in C-3 plants shows respiration rules when photosynthesis is low. *Nat. Plants* **6**, 245–258 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41477-020-0606-6
- 27 Brueggemann, N., Gessler, A., Kayler, Z., Keel, S.G., Badeck, F., Barthel, M. et al. (2011) Carbon allocation and carbon isotope fluxes in the plant-soil-atmosphere continuum: a review. *Biogeosciences* 8, 3457–3489 https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-8-3457-2011
- 28 Keeling, R.F., Graven, H.D., Welp, L.R., Resplandy, L., Bi, J., Piper, S.C. et al. (2017) Atmospheric evidence for a global secular increase in carbon isotopic discrimination of land photosynthesis. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **114**, 10361–10366 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1619240114
- 29 Farquhar, G.D. (1983) On the nature of carbon isotope discrimination in C4 species. Funct. Plant Biol. 10, 205–226 https://doi.org/10.1071/ PP9830205
- 30 Minasny, B., Malone, B.P., McBratney, A.B., Angers, D.A., Arrouays, D., Chambers, A. et al. (2017) Soil carbon 4 per mille. *Geoderma* 292, 59–86 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2017.01.002
- 31 Zatta, A., Clifton-Brown, J., Robson, P., Hastings, A. and Monti, A. (2014) Land use change from C3 grassland to C4 Miscanthus: effects on soil carbon content and estimated mitigation benefit after six years. *GCB Bioenergy* **6**, 360–370 https://doi.org/10.1111/gcbb.12054
- 32 Ye, C. and Hall, S.J. (2020) Mechanisms underlying limited soil carbon gains in perennial and cover-cropped bioenergy systems revealed by stable isotopes. *GCB Bioenergy* **12**, 101–117 https://doi.org/10.1111/gcbb.12657
- 33 Balesdent, J., Basile-Doelsch, I., Chadoeuf, J., Cornu, S., Derrien, D., Fekiacova, Z. et al. (2018) Atmosphere-soil carbon transfer as a function of soil depth. *Nature* **559**, 599–602 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-018-0328-3
- 34 Heinrich, S., Dippold, M.A., Werner, C., Wiesenberg, G.L.B., Kuzyakov, Y. and Glaser, B. (2015) Allocation of freshly assimilated carbon into primary and secondary metabolites after in situ C-13 pulse labelling of Norway spruce (*Picea abies*). *Tree Physiol.* 35, 1176–1191 https://doi.org/10.1093/treephys/tpv083
- 35 Fitter, A.H., Graves, J.D., Watkins, N.K., Robinson, D. and Scrimgeour, C. (1998) Carbon transfer between plants and its control in networks of arbuscular mycorrhizas. *Funct. Ecol.* **12**, 406–412 https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2435.1998.00206.x
- 36 Klein, T., Siegwolf, R.T.W. and Körner, C. (2016) Belowground carbon trade among tall trees in a temperate forest. *Science* **352**, 342–344 https://doi. org/10.1126/science.aad6188
- 37 Hannula, S.E., Morrien, E., de Hollander, M., van der Putten, W.H., van Veen, J.A. and de Boer, W. (2017) Shifts in rhizosphere fungal community during secondary succession following abandonment from agriculture. *ISME J.* **11**, 2294–2304 https://doi.org/10.1038/ismej.2017.90
- 38 Haddix, M.L., Gregorich, E.G. Helgason, B.L., Janzen, H., Ellert, B.H. and Cotrufo, M.F. (2020) Climate, carbon content, and soil texture control the independent formation and persistence of particulate and mineral-associated organic matter in soil. *Geoderma* 363, 114160 https://doi.org/10.1016/j. geoderma.2019.114160
- 39 Walker, A.P., De Kauwe, M.G., Bastos, A., Belmecheri, S., Georgiou, K., Keeling, R. et al. (2020) Integrating the evidence for a terrestrial carbon sink caused by increasing atmospheric CO2. *New Phytol.* 229, 2413–2445 https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.16866
- 40 Melillo, J.M., Frey, S.D., DeAngelis, K.M., Werner, W.J., Bernard, M.J., Bowles, F.P. et al. (2017) Long-term pattern and magnitude of soil carbon feedback to the climate system in a warming world. *Science* **358**, 101–105 https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aan2874



- 41 Bowling, D.R., Baldocchi, D.D. and Monson, R.K. (1999) Dynamics of isotopic exchange of carbon dioxide in a Tennessee deciduous forest. *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* **13**, 903–922 https://doi.org/10.1029/1999GB900072
- 42 Wehr, R., Munger, J.W., McManus, J.B., Nelson, D.D., Zahniser, M.S., Davidson, E.A. et al. (2016) Seasonality of temperate forest photosynthesis and daytime respiration. *Nature* **534**, 680–683 https://doi.org/10.1038/nature17966
- 43 Oikawa, P.Y., Sturtevant, C., Knox, S.H., Verfaillie, J., Huang, Y.W. and Baldocchi, D.D. (2017) Revisiting the partitioning of net ecosystem exchange of CO2 into photosynthesis and respiration with simultaneous flux measurements of 13CO2 and CO2, soil respiration and a biophysical model, CANVEG. *Agric. For. Meteorol.* 234, 149–163 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agrformet.2016.12.016
- 44 Lee, S.-C., Christen, A., Black, T.A., Jassal, R.S., Ketler, R. and Nesic, Z. (2020) Partitioning of net ecosystem exchange into photosynthesis and respiration using continuous stable isotope measurements in a Pacific Northwest Douglas-fir forest ecosystem. *Agric. For. Meteorol.* 292–293, 108109 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agrformet.2020.108109
- 45 Huang, W. and Hall, S.J. (2018) Large impacts of small methane fluxes on carbon isotope values of soil respiration. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **124**, 126–133 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2018.06.003
- 46 Metzger, S., Ayres, E., Durden, D., Florian, C., Lee, R., Lunch, C. et al. (2019) From NEON field sites to data portal: a community resource for surfaceatmosphere research comes online. *Bull. Am. Meteorol. Soc.* 100, 2305–2325 https://doi.org/10.1175/BAMS-D-17-0307.1
- 47 Wilcox, B.P. and Thurow, T.L. (2006) Emerging issues in rangeland ecohydrology: vegetation change and the water cycle. *Rangel. Ecol. Manag.* **59**, 220–224 https://doi.org/10.2111/05-090R1.1
- 48 Jasechko, S., Sharp, Z.D., Gibson, J.J., Jean Birks, S., Yi, Y. and Fawcett, P.J. (2013) Terrestrial water fluxes dominated by transpiration. *Nature* **496**, 347–350 https://doi.org/10.1038/nature11983
- 49 Allen, S.T., Keim, R.F., Barnard, H.R., McDonnell, J.J. and Renée Brooks, J. (2017) The role of stable isotopes in understanding rainfall interception processes: a review. *Wiley Interdiscip. Rev. Water* **4**, e1187 https://doi.org/10.1002/wat2.1187
- 50 Gat, J. (2010) Isotope Hydrology: A Study of the Water Cycle, Imperial College Press, London
- 51 Herrero, A., Castro, J., Zamora, R., Delgado-Huertas, A. and Querejeta, J.I. (2013) Growth and stable isotope signals associated with drought-related mortality in saplings of two coexisting pine species. *Oecologia* **173**, 1613–1624 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00442-013-2707-7
- 52 Peters, W., van der Velde, I.R., van Schaik, E., Miller, J.B., Ciais, P., Duarte, H.F. et al. (2018) Increased water-use efficiency and reduced CO2 uptake by plants during droughts at a continental scale. *Nat. Geosci.* **11**, 744–748 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-018-0212-7
- 53 Cernusak, L.A., Barbour, M.M., Arndt, S.K., Cheesman, A.W., English, N.B., Feild, T.S. et al. (2016) Stable isotopes in leaf water of terrestrial plants. *Plant Cell Environ.* **39**, 1087–1102 https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.12703
- 54 Boegelein, R., Thomas, F.M. and Kahmen, A. (2017) Leaf water 0-18 and H-2 enrichment along vertical canopy profiles in a broadleaved and a conifer forest tree. *Plant Cell Environ.* 40, 1086–1103 https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.12895
- 55 Berry, Z.C., Carter Berry, Z., Emery, N.C., Gotsch, S.G. and Goldsmith, G.R. (2019) Foliar water uptake: processes, pathways, and integration into plant water budgets. *Plant Cell Environ.* **42**, 410–423 https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.13439
- 56 Cernusak, L.A., Ubierna, N., Jenkins, M.W., Garrity, S.R., Rahn, T., Powers, H.H. et al. (2018) Unsaturation of vapour pressure inside leaves of two conifer species. *Sci. Rep.* **8**, 7667 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-018-25838-2
- 57 Sachse, D., Billault, I., Bowen, G.J., Chikaraishi, Y., Dawson, T.E., Feakins, S.J. et al. (2012) Molecular paleohydrology: interpreting the hydrogen-isotopic composition of lipid biomarkers from photosynthesizing organisms. *Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci.* **40**, 221–249 https://doi.org/10. 1146/annurev-earth-042711-105535
- 58 Loader, N.J., Street-Perrott, F.A., Daley, T.J., Hughes, P.D.M., Kimak, A., Levanič, T. et al. (2015) Simultaneous determination of stable carbon, oxygen, and hydrogen isotopes in cellulose. Anal. Chem. 87, 376–380 https://doi.org/10.1021/ac502557x
- 59 Farquhar, G.D. and Lloyd, J. (1993) 5 Carbon and Oxygen Isotope Effects in the Exchange of Carbon Dioxide between Terrestrial Plants and the Atmosphere. In Stable Isotopes and Plant Carbon-Water Relations (Ehleringer, J.R., Hall, A.E., Farquhar, G.D., eds.), pp. 47–70, Academic Press, San Diego
- 60 Barbour, M.M., Farquhar, G.D. and Buckley, T.N. (2017) Leaf water stable isotopes and water transport outside the xylem. *Plant Cell Environ.* **40**, 914–920 https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.12845
- 61 Volkmann, T.H.M., Kuehnhammer, K., Herbstritt, B., Gessler, A. and Weiler, M. (2016) A method for in situ monitoring of the isotope composition of tree xylem water using laser spectroscopy. *Plant Cell Environ.* **39**, 2055–2063 https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.12725
- 62 Orians, C.M., van Vuuren, M.M.I., Harris, N.L., Babst, B.A. and Ellmore, G.S. (2004) Differential sectoriality in long-distance transport in temperate tree species: evidence from dye flow, 15 N transport, and vessel element pitting. *Trees* **18**, 501–509 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00468-004-0326-y
- 63 Nadezhdina, N. (2010) Integration of water transport pathways in a maple tree: responses of sap flow to branch severing. Ann. For. Sci. 67, 107 https://doi.org/10.1051/forest/2009092
- 64 Cernusak, L.A., Farquhar, G.D. and Pate, J.S. (2005) Environmental and physiological controls over oxygen and carbon isotope composition of Tasmanian blue gum, *Eucalyptus globulus. Tree Physiol.* **25**, 129–146 https://doi.org/10.1093/treephys/25.2.129
- 65 Zhao, L., Wang, L., Cernusak, L.A., Liu, X., Xiao, H., Zhou, M. et al. (2016) Significant difference in hydrogen isotope composition between xylem and tissue water in populus euphratica. *Plant Cell Environ.* **39**, 1848–1857 https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.12753
- 66 Barbeta, A., Burlett, R., Martín-Gómez, P., Fréjaville, B., Devert, N., Wingate, L. et al. (2020) Evidence for distinct isotopic composition of sap and tissue water in tree stems: consequences for plant water source identification. *bioRxiv* https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.06.18.160002
- 67 Earles, J.M., Mason Earles, J., Sperling, O., Silva, L.C.R., McElrone, A.J., Brodersen, C.R. et al. (2016) Bark water uptake promotes localized hydraulic recovery in coastal redwood crown. *Plant Cell Environ.* **39**, 320–328 https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.12612
- 68 De Schepper, V., van Dusschoten, D., Copini, P., Jahnke, S. and Steppe, K. (2012) MRI links stem water content to stem diameter variations in transpiring trees. *J. Exp. Bot.* **63**, 2645–2653 https://doi.org/10.1093/jxb/err445
- 69 Goldsmith, G.R., Muñoz-Villers, L.E., Holwerda, F., McDonnell, J.J., Asbjornsen, H. and Dawson, T.E. (2012) Stable isotopes reveal linkages among ecohydrological processes in a seasonally dry tropical montane cloud forest. *Ecohydrology* **5**, 779–790 https://doi.org/10.1002/eco.268
- 70 Barbeta, A. and Peñuelas, J. (2017) Relative contribution of groundwater to plant transpiration estimated with stable isotopes. *Sci. Rep.* **7**, 10580 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-017-09643-x
- 71 McDonnell, J.J. (2014) The two water worlds hypothesis: ecohydrological separation of water between streams and trees? *WIREs Water* 1, 323–329 https://doi.org/10.1002/wat2.1027



- 72 Barbeta, A., Mejía-Chang, M., Ogaya, R., Voltas, J., Dawson, T.E. and Peñuelas, J. (2015) The combined effects of a long-term experimental drought and an extreme drought on the use of plant-water sources in a Mediterranean forest. *Glob Chang Biol* **21**, 1213–1225 https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12785
- 73 Stumpp, C., Brüggemann, N. and Wingate, L. (2018) Stable isotope approaches in vadose zone research. Vadose Zone J. 17, 180096 https://doi.org/ 10.2136/vzj2018.05.0096
- 74 Dawson, T.E. and Ehleringer, J.R. (1993) Isotopic enrichment of water in the "woody" tissues of plants: implications for plant water source, water uptake, and other studies which use the stable isotopic composition of cellulose. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **57**, 3487–3492 https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(93)90554-A
- 75 Gaj, M., Kaufhold, S., Koeniger, P., Beyer, M., Weiler, M. and Himmelsbach, T. (2017) Mineral mediated isotope fractionation of soil water. *Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom.* **31**, 269–280 https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.7787
- 76 Sternberg L da, S.L., Ish-Shalom-Gordon, N., Ross, M. and O'Brien, J. (1991) Water relations of coastal plant communities near the ocean/freshwater boundary. *Oecologia* 88, 305–310 https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00317571
- 77 Ellsworth, P.Z. and Williams, D.G. (2007) Hydrogen isotope fractionation during water uptake by woody xerophytes. Plant Soil 291, 93–107 https://doi. org/10.1007/s11104-006-9177-1
- 78 Poca, M., Coomans, O., Urcelay, C., Zeballos, S.R., Bode, S. and Boeckx, P. (2019) Isotope fractionation during root water uptake by Acacia caven is enhanced by arbuscular mycorrhizas. *Plant Soil* **441**, 485–497 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11104-019-04139-1
- 79 Goldsmith, G.R., Lehmann, M.M., Cernusak, L.A., Arend, M. and Siegwolf, R.T.W. (2017) Inferring foliar water uptake using stable isotopes of water. *Oecologia* 184, 763–766 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00442-017-3917-1
- 80 Penna, D., Geris, J., Hopp, L. and Scandellari, F. (2020) Water sources for root water uptake: using stable isotopes of hydrogen and oxygen as a research tool in agricultural and agroforestry systems. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **291**, 106790 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2019.106790
- 81 Volkmann, T.H.M. and Weiler, M. (2014) Continual in situ monitoring of pore water stable isotopes in the subsurface. *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci.* 18, 1819–1833 https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-18-1819-2014
- 82 Beyer, M., Kühnhammer, K. and Dubbert, M. (2020) In situ measurements of soil and plant water isotopes: a review of approaches, practical considerations and a vision for the future. *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci.* **24**, 4413–4440 https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-24-4413-2020
- 83 Kagawa, A. (2020) Foliar water uptake as a source of hydrogen and oxygen in plant biomass. *bioRxiv* https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.08.20.260372
- 84 Oerter, E.J., Siebert, G., Bowling, D.R. and Bowen, G. (2019) Soil water vapour isotopes identify missing water source for streamside trees: Soil water vapor isotopes identify water source for streamside trees. *Ecohydrology* **12**, e2083 https://doi.org/10.1002/eco.2083
- 85 Berry, Z.C., Carter Berry, Z., Evaristo, J., Moore, G., Poca, M., Steppe, K. et al. (2018) The two water worlds hypothesis: Addressing multiple working hypotheses and proposing a way forward. *Ecohydrology* **11**, e1843 https://doi.org/10.1002/eco.1843
- 86 Goldsmith, G.R., Allen, S.T., Braun, S., Engbersen, N., Gonzalez-Quijano, C.R., Kirchner, J.W. et al. (2019) Spatial variation in throughfall, soil, and plant water isotopes in a temperate forest. *Ecohydrology* 12, e2059 https://doi.org/10.1002/eco.2059
- 87 Fowler, D., Coyle, M., Skiba, U., Sutton, M.A., Cape, J.N., Reis, S. et al. (2013) The global nitrogen cycle in the twenty-first century. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond. B Biol. Sci.* 368, 20130164 https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2013.0164
- 88 Aber, J.D., Nadelhoffer, K.J., Steudler, P. and Melillo, J.M. (1989) Nitrogen saturation in northern forest ecosystems. *Bioscience* **39**, 378–286 https://doi.org/10.2307/1311067
- 89 Nuccio, E.E., Hodge, A., Pett-Ridge, J., Herman, D.J., Weber, P.K. and Firestone, M.K. (2013) An arbuscular mycorrhizal fungus significantly modifies the soil bacterial community and nitrogen cycling during litter decomposition. *Environ. Microbiol.* **15**, 1870–1881 https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-2920. 12081
- 90 Seaman, C., Flinders, B., Eijkel, G., Heeren, R.M.A., Bricklebank, N. and Clench, M.R. (2014) "Afterlife experiment": use of MALDI-MS and SIMS imaging for the study of the nitrogen cycle within plants. *Anal. Chem.* 86, 10071–10077 https://doi.org/10.1021/ac501191w
- 91 Gardner, J.B. and Drinkwater, L.E. (2009) The fate of nitrogen in grain cropping systems: a meta-analysis of 15N field experiments. *Ecol. Appl.* **19**, 2167–2184 https://doi.org/10.1890/08-1122.1
- 92 Yan, M., Pan, G., Lavallee, J.M. and Conant, R.T. (2020) Rethinking sources of nitrogen to cereal crops. *Glob. Change Biol.* 26, 191–199 https://doi. org/10.1111/gcb.14908
- 93 Booth, M.S., Stark, J.M. and Rastetter, E. (2005) Controls on nitrogen cycling in terrestrial ecosystems: a synthetic analysis of literature data. *Ecol. Monogr.* 75, 139–157 https://doi.org/10.1890/04-0988
- 94 Wanek, W., Mooshammer, M., Blöchl, A., Hanreich, A. and Richter, A. (2010) Determination of gross rates of amino acid production and immobilization in decomposing leaf litter by a novel 15N isotope pool dilution technique. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 42, 1293–1302 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2010.04. 001
- 95 Yang, W.H., Teh, Y.A. and Silver, W.L. (2011) A test of a field-based 15N–nitrous oxide pool dilution technique to measure gross N2O production in soil. *Glob. Change Biol.* **17**, 3577–3588 https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2011.02481.x
- 96 Yang, W.H. and Silver, W.L. (2016) Net soil-atmosphere fluxes mask patterns in gross production and consumption of nitrous oxide and methane in a managed ecosystem. *Biogeosciences* 13, 1705–1715 https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-13-1705-2016
- 97 Yang, W.H. and Silver, W.L. (2016) Gross nitrous oxide production drives net nitrous oxide fluxes across a salt marsh landscape. *Glob. Change Biol.* 22, 2228–2237 https://doi.org/10.1111/qcb.13203
- 98 Macko, S.A., Estep, M.L.F., Engel, M.H. and Hare, P.E. (1986) Kinetic fractionation of stable nitrogen isotopes during amino acid transamination. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 50, 2143–2146 https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(86)90068-2
- 99 Philben, M., Billings, S.A., Edwards, K.A., Podrebarac, F.A., van Biesen, G. and Ziegler, S.E. (2018) Amino acid delta N-15 indicates lack of N isotope fractionation during soil organic nitrogen decomposition. *Biogeochemistry* **138**, 69–83 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-018-0429-y
- 100 Mariotti, A., Germon, J.C., Hubert, P., Kaiser, P., Letolle, R., Tardieux, A. et al. (1981) Experimental determination of nitrogen kinetic isotope fractionation: Some principles; illustration for the denitrification and nitrification processes. *Plant Soil* **62**, 413–430 https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02374138
- 101 Soper, F.M., Boutton, T.W. and Sparks, J.P. (2015) Investigating patterns of symbiotic nitrogen fixation during vegetation change from grassland to woodland using fine scale δ15N measurements. *Plant Cell Environ.* **38**, 89–100 https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.12373
- 102 Shearer, G. and Kohl, D.H. (1986) N2-fixation in field settings: estimations based on natural 15N abundance. Funct. Plant Biol. 13, 699–756 https://doi.org/10.1071/pp9860699



- 103 Houlton, B.Z., Sigman, D.M. and Hedin, L.O. (2006) Isotopic evidence for large gaseous nitrogen losses from tropical rainforests. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 103, 8745–8750 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0510185103
- 104 Craine, J.M., Elmore, A.J., Wang, L., Aranibar, J., Bauters, M., Boeckx, P. et al. (2018) Isotopic evidence for oligotrophication of terrestrial ecosystems. *Nat. Ecol. Evol.* 2, 1735–1744 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41559-018-0694-0
- 105 Granger, J. and Wankel, S.D. (2016) Isotopic overprinting of nitrification on denitrification as a ubiquitous and unifying feature of environmental nitrogen cycling. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **113**, E6391–E6400 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1601383113
- 106 Michalski, G. and Bhattacharya, S.K. (2009) The role of symmetry in the mass independent isotope effect in ozone. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **106**, 5493–5496 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0812755106
- 107 Michalski, G., Meixner, T., Fenn, M., Hernandez, L., Sirulnik, A., Allen, E. et al. (2004) Tracing atmospheric nitrate deposition in a complex semiarid ecosystem using Δ170. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **38**, 2175–2181 https://doi.org/10.1021/es034980+
- 108 Yu, Z. and Elliott, E.M. (2018) Probing soil nitrification and nitrate consumption using ∆170 of soil nitrate. Soil Biol. Biochem. 127, 187–199 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2018.09.029
- 109 Bourgeois, I., Clément, J.-C., Caillon, N. and Savarino, J. (2019) Foliar uptake of atmospheric nitrate by two dominant subalpine plants: insights from in situ triple-isotope analysis. *New Phytol.* **223**, 1784–1794 https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.15761
- 110 Rose, L.A., Elliott, E.M. and Adams, M.B. (2015) Triple nitrate isotopes indicate differing nitrate source contributions to streams across a nitrogen saturation gradient. *Ecosystems* **18**, 1209–1223 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10021-015-9891-8
- 111 Huang, S., Wang, F., Elliott, E.M., Zhu, F., Zhu, W., Koba, K. et al. (2020) Multiyear measurements on Δ170 of stream nitrate indicate high nitrate production in a temperate forest. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **54**, 4231–4239 https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.9b07839
- 112 Fang, Y., Koba, K., Makabe, A., Takahashi, C., Zhu, W., Hayashi, T. et al. (2015) Microbial denitrification dominates nitrate losses from forest ecosystems. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **112**, 1470–1474 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1416776112
- 113 Soper, F.M. (2019) Three's a crowd: triple-isotope analysis traces alternate plant nitrogen nutrition pathways. *New Phytol.* **223**, 1687–1689 https://doi. org/10.1111/nph.16025
- 114 Yoshida, N. and Toyoda, S. (2000) Constraining the atmospheric N2O budget from intramolecular site preference in N2O isotopomers. *Nature* **405**, 330–334 https://doi.org/10.1038/35012558
- 115 Sutka, R.L., Ostrom, N.E., Ostrom, P.H., Breznak, J.A., Gandhi, H., Pitt, A.J. et al. (2006) Distinguishing nitrous oxide production from nitrification and denitrification on the basis of isotopomer abundances. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **72**, 638–644 https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.72.1.638-644.2006
- 116 Toyoda, S., Mutobe, H., Yamagishi, H., Yoshida, N. and Tanji, Y. (2005) Fractionation of N2O isotopomers during production by denitrifier. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **37**, 1535–1545 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2005.01.009
- 117 Sutka, R.L., Ostrom, N.E., Ostrom, P.H., Gandhi, H. and Breznak, J.A. (2003) Nitrogen isotopomer site preference of N20 produced by *Nitrosomonas* europaea and *Methylococcus capsulatus* bath. *Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom.* **17**, 738–745 https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.968
- 118 Sutka, R.L., Adams, G.C., Ostrom, N.E. and Ostrom, P.H. (2008) Isotopologue fractionation during N(2)O production by fungal denitrification. *Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom.* **22**, 3989–3996 https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.3820
- 119 Wolf, B., Merbold, L., Decock, C., Tuzson, B., Harris, E., Six, J. et al. (2015) First on-line isotopic characterization of N2O emitted from intensively managed grassland. *Biogeosci. Discuss.* **12**, 2517–2531 https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-12-2517-2015
- 120 Ibraim, E., Wolf, B., Harris, E., Gasche, R., Wei, J., Yu, L. et al. (2019) Attribution of N2O sources in a grassland soil with laser spectroscopy based isotopocule analysis. *Biogeosciences* **16**, 3247–3266 https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-16-3247-2019
- 121 Lewicka-Szczebak, D., Lewicki, M.P. and Well, R. (2020) N₂o isotope approaches for source partitioning of N₂O production and estimation of N₂O reduction validation with the ¹⁵N gas-flux method in laboratory and field studies. *Biogeosciences* **17**, 5513–5537 https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-17-5513-2020
- 122 Yu, L., Harris, E., Lewicka-Szczebak, D., Barthel, M., Blomberg, M.R.A., Harris, S.J. et al. (2020) What can we learn from N2 0 isotope data? -Analytics, processes and modelling. *Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom.* **34**, e8858 https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.8858
- 123 Toyoda, S., Yoshida, N. and Koba, K. (2017) Isotopocule analysis of biologically produced nitrous oxide in various environments. *Mass Spectrom. Rev.* **36**, 135–160 https://doi.org/10.1002/mas.21459
- 124 Yu, L., Harris, E., Henne, S., Eggleston, S., Steinbacher, M., Emmenegger, L. et al. (2020) The isotopic composition of atmospheric nitrous oxide observed at the high-altitude research station Jungfraujoch, Switzerland. Atmos. Chem. Phys. 20, 6495–6519 https://doi.org/10.5194/ acp-20-6495-2020
- 125 Wu, D., Well, R., Cárdenas, L.M., Fuß, R., Lewicka-Szczebak, D., Köster, J.R. et al. (2019) Quantifying N20 reduction to N2 during denitrification in soils via isotopic mapping approach: model evaluation and uncertainty analysis. *Environ. Res.* **179**, 108806 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2019.108806
- 126 Harris, S.J., Liisberg, J., Xia, L., Wei, J., Zeyer, K., Yu, L. et al. (2020) N₂o isotopocule measurements using laser spectroscopy: analyzer characterization and intercomparison. *Atmos Meas Tech.* **13**, 2797–2831 https://doi.org/10.5194/amt-13-2797-2020
- 127 Ostrom, P.H., DeCamp, S., Gandhi, H., Haslun, J. and Ostrom, N.E. (2021) The influence of tillage and fertilizer on the flux and source of nitrous oxide with reference to atmospheric variation using laser spectroscopy. *Biogeochemistry* https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-020-00742-y